#### MINUTES

#### MEETING OF THE BOARD OF DIRECTORS

#### **PLANNING & EXTERNAL RELATIONS COMMITTEE**

#### METROPOLITAN ATLANTA RAPID TRANSIT AUTHORITY

## January 28, 2013

The Board of Directors Planning & External Relations Committee met on January 28, 2013 at 10:04 a.m. in the Board Room on the 6<sup>th</sup> Floor of the MARTA Headquarters Building, 2424 Piedmont Road, Atlanta, Georgia.

# **Board Members Present**

Robert L. Ashe III
Harold Buckley, Sr.
Wendy Butler, Chair
Frederick L. Daniels, Jr.
Jim Durrett
Roderick E. Edmond
Noni Ellison-Southall
Barbara Babbit Kaufman
Jannine Miller\*

MARTA officials in attendance were: General Manager/ CEO Keith T. Parker, AICP; Interim Deputy General Manager/COO Davis Allen (Acting); AGMs Deborah Dawson, Wanda Dunham, Ric Edmonds (Acting), Ben Graham, Robin Howard, Mary Ann Jackson, Cheryl King, Miriam Lancaster (Acting), Ryland McClendon and Elizabeth O'Neill; Sr. Directors Rhonda Briggins and Donald Williams; Directors John Crocker, Maurcice Ficklin, Scott Haggard, Lyle Harris, Ming Hsi and Ferdinand Risco; Managers Joyce Brown and John Remillard; Executive Manager to the Board Rebbie Ellisor-Taylor; Manager, Executive Office Administration Tyrene L. Huff; Finance Administrative Analyst Tracy Kincaid. Others in attendance Alphonse Eugene, Williams Jones, Anthony Pines, Srinath Remala and Tuan Vo.

Also in attendance Charles Pursley, Jr. of Pursley, Friese Torgrimson, LLP; Jared Lombard of Atlanta Regional Commission; Granvel Tate of Invest Atlanta; Pam Alexander of LTK Engineering; Alan Bradford and Don Brooks of St. Joseph's Hospital.

<sup>\*</sup>Jannine Miller is Executive Director of the Georgia Regional Transportation Authority (GRTA) and is therefore a non-voting member of the MARTA Board of Directors

# Approval of the December 17, 2012 Planning & External Relations Committee Meeting Minutes

On motion by Mr. Durrett seconded by Mr. Daniels, the minutes were unanimously approved by a vote of 5 to 0, with 5 members present.

# Resolution Authorizing Approval of 2013 Title VI Program

Mr. Risco presented this resolution requesting the Board of Directors to authorize approval of the 2013 Title VI Program and its submission to the Federal Transit Authority.

Mr. Durrett asked are there any significant changes for this tri-annual period.

Mr. Risco said the Circular has a few minor changes – one of them is the Board must approve the Plan. Another is the environmental justice component was removed.

Mrs. Butler asked how can MARTA balance environmental justice.

Mr. Risco said an analysis will find impacts and how to mitigate those. He added that MARTA will ensure that the public is fully engaged, because that is the spirit of Title VI

Mrs. Butler said MARTA does a good job with outreach and gaining input from the public.

On motion by Mr. Durrett seconded by Mrs. Kaufman, the resolution was unanimously approved by a vote of 6 to 0, with 6 members present.

Resolution Authorizing Advertising for Disposition of Property Rights in the Parcel Known as D1158 the Former Stone Mountain Park & Ride Lot Located Northeast of 4th Street and Manor Drive, Stone Mountain, DeKalb County, Georgia

Mr. Remillard presented this resolution for Board of Directors' approval authorizing the General Manager/CEO or his delegate to advertise the sale of property rights in the parcel known as D1158, the Former Stone Mountain Park & Ride Lot.

Mr. Daniels asked what is the sales price.

Mr. Remillard responded that it is \$160,000.

Mrs. Butler asked if there are any environmental issues.

Mr. Remillard said there were none.

Mrs. Kaufman asked who has shown interest.

Mr. Remillard said the City of Stone Mountain was interested but it turned out they did not have a budget for it. MARTA will send it to all the brokers that might be interested, it will be advertised in the newspaper and a sign will be placed on it. The bid opening will likely take place in the May-June timeframe.

Mrs. Butler asked about acreage and zoning of land use.

Mr. Remillard said the parcel is 2.54 acres and it is zoned for R-2 Residential and Village Center, Mixed-use.

On motion by Mr. Durrett seconded by Mr. Ashe, the resolution was approved by a vote of 6 to 0, with 8\* members present.

Dr. Edmond abstained.

### Briefing - Public Hearing Results

Mrs. Briggins briefed the Committee on Public Hearing results for proposed Service Modifications effective April 20, 2013.

Public Hearings were held on Tuesday, January 22, 2013 at Adamsville Recreation Center and on Thursday, January 24, 2013 at DeKalb Maloof Auditorium and MARTA Headquarters.

#### Proposed Service Modifications

- Route 6 Emory
- Route 15 South DeKalb/Candler Road
- Route 21 Memorial Drive
- Route 51 Joseph E. Boone Blvd./Dixie Hills
- Route 67 West End

# Planning & External Relations Committee 1/28/13

# Page 4

- Route 86 Fairington Road/McAfee Road
- Route 95 Metropolitan Pkwy./Hapeville
- Route 110 Peachtree Street "The Peach"
- Route 172 Sylvan Road/Virginia Avenue
- Route 186 Rainbow Drive/South DeKalb

#### Notification

- MARTA Website
- TRN
- Twitter
- Facebook
- Atlanta Journal Constitution
- Local and weekly publications
- Hispanic newspaper

# System-Wide Distribution

- Announcements
  - Buses/Rail Stations
  - Government TV
    - Fulton, DeKalb & City of Atlanta
  - MARTA Stop
  - o Email Blast

# Flyers Distribution

- DeKalb County Library System (20 Branches)
- Libraries along Route 110 (Buckhead Branch & Peachtree Branch)
- Greenforest Baptist Church
- Ray of Hope Christian Church
- New Piney Grove Missionary Baptist Church
- Atlanta Chinese Community Church
- Korean Community Center
- Chinese Community Center
- Vietnamese Market
- Buford Farmers Market
- Center for Pan Asian American Community Services

#### MARTA Station Outreach

- Thirteen (13) stations visited, from where the proposed routes begin or terminate:
  - Lindbergh, Arts Center, Inman Park, Decatur, Five Points, Oakland
     City, College Park, East Lake, Kensington, Lenox, West End, West
     Lake & Georgia State
- Seven (7) days, 3:00 6:00 pm
- One (1) Community Outreach Planner, Two (2) Planners/Schedulers
- Set up information table and specific route map
- Planner/Outreach personnel distributes information on the incoming and outgoing route proposed for change
- Approximately 3,200 riders reached in the 7-day period
- Great feedback from riders thanking MARTA for coming its outreach efforts

### Public Hearing Comments

- Adamsville Recreation Center
  - o Attendees 7, Speakers 2, Media 1
  - 2 comments opposing Route 51 riders are opposing the service being discontinued along Aurora Ave., Morehouse Dr., Morris Brown Ave. and Wadley St.
- DeKalb Maloof Auditorium
  - o Attendees 13, Speakers 6, Media 0
  - Supports the proposed Route 110 but concerned about Route 6 modifications
  - Oppose changes to Route 6 negative impact on connectivity to Inman Park Station
  - Supports the realignment of Route 15
  - Concerns about the budget process and rationale for proposed changes

- EDACC member concerned about the proposed fare increase covered in media and process of notifying mobility customers about public hearings
- Reinstate bus Routes 111 and 115
- MARTA Headquarters
  - o Attendees 12, Speakers 7, Media 1
  - 4 comments opposing Route 110 changes, especially in the a.m. peak
  - o 3 comments opposing Route 51 changes and the service being discontinued along residential streets and places of worship
- Comment Line
  - o 5 total
    - 4 calls opposing changes in Route 110
    - 1 call opposing changes to Route 67
- Comment Forms
  - o 22 total
    - 16 general questions and suggestions (other routes, restrooms, 24 hour service)
    - 2 opposing changes to Route 110
    - 2 opposing changes to Route 15
    - 1 opposing changes to Route 86
    - 1 opposing changes to Route 51
- Emails
  - o 8 total
    - 2 opposing changes to Route 6
    - 5 opposing changes to Route 110
    - 1 opposing changes to Route 186
    - 1 opposing changes to Route 5
- Petitions
  - o 3 total

- Route 124 (Pleasantdale Road) riders of the route
- Route 51 (Joseph E. Boone Blvd./Dixie Hills)
  - Dixie Hills First Baptist Church, opposing changes
  - MAM (Morehouse Dr. Aurora Ave. Morris Brown Ave.), opposing changes

Ms. Miller asked what about notification requirements.

Mrs. Briggins said MARTA is required to provide notification via newspaper but the Authority goes well beyond that requirement.

Mrs. Butler said a lot of comments came in about Route 110. She asked if staff is taking a look at that.

Mrs. Briggins said yes.

Mr. Daniels asked if staff communicates directly with commenters.

Mrs. Briggins said all comments go on a final record. Staff has dialogue with commenters that attend a Public Hearing.

Mr. Daniels said staff should look at adding responses to MARTA's website so people know that their comments did reach the Board.

# Briefing – Overview of Atlanta Regional Commission (ARC) Transit Oriented Development Study (TOD)

Dr. Crocker briefed the Committee on the ARC's TOD work and its impact to MARTA.

- ➢ In 2012, the ARC engaged Bleakly Advisory Group to conduct a TOD Market Analysis study.
- > MARTA has been in a process of identifying which sites should be recommended for release for joint development before the end of June 2014 (end of FY14).
- ➤ Goal: By July 2014 have five (5) active Joint Development projects substantially underway (Made in Summer 2012)

# ARC Market Study Overview

- Provide consistent market data for each station available to MARTA and local governments
  - o Includes non-MARTA owned, station adjacent, properties
- High-level scan of the opportunities at each station
  - Helped to refine Joint Development Work Program
- Detailed Development Opportunities at example stations
  - Stations selected in consultation with MARTA
  - Provided information for MARTA's use in developing its Joint Development Work Program
- Determine public sector incentives might be needed to encourage development
- Conducted by Bleakly Advisory Group for ARC

#### ARC Market Study Overall Findings

- Within the 37 MARTA rail transit areas (1/2 mile radius of stations):
  - o 286,754 combined jobs
  - o 15% of Atlanta 10-county region's jobs
  - o 29% of combined Fulton / DeKalb jobs
  - 59% of these employees make \$40k+/year (versus 46% in Fulton / DeKalb overall)
- MARTA's Rail System has attracted these jobs on only 3.6% of total land area within Fulton and DeKalb counties
- Combined 34 mile radius are:
  - 43% of the combined Fulton / DeKalb office space
  - o 27% of the combined Fulton / DeKalb retail space
  - o 8% of the combined Fulton / DeKalb housing units
- Clustering of office and retail is a reality the next opportunity is in residents (housing)
- Identified potential incentives for specific stations:
  - Those that are Tax Allocation Districts
  - o Those that are or eligible for Opportunity Zone

# Planning & External Relations Committee 1/28/13 Page 9

· Helps identify incentives

## Relationship to Work Program

- Goal: By July 2014 have five (5) active Joint Development projects substantially underway (Made in Summer 2012)
- Fall 2012: Used Technical Analysis to focus on specific potential sites (presented November 2012)
- ARC Work:
  - o Identifies Housing as a principal area of opportunity
  - o Provides Independent Real Estate Market Evaluation around sites proposed for release in FY13-15
  - o Identifies Opportunities for Outside Funding Support
    - TADs
    - Opportunity Work
- Market Analysis suggest these following MARTA identified sites would likely have private sector developer interest
  - o Avondale
  - o Brookhaven
  - o King Memorial
  - o Lindbergh Center
  - Sandy Springs (Abernathy)
- These sites will likely need additional public sector development assistance (i.e. TAD or OZ incentives)
  - o Hamilton E. Holmes
  - o Lakewood

## Next Steps in FY13

- Reacquire Abernathy Hotel Site per existing ground lease
- Hold Developer Information Day (goal late Feb/early Mar)
- With local government partners, identify additional funding needs (TADs or LCI projects) and needed modifications to local regulations and zoning (to reduce risk to private sector development partners)
- Evaluation and recommendation of Planning Technical Assistance

• Prepare information to release sites to be made available in FY14 to meet goal of five (5) active projects by end of FY2014

Ms. Miller asked about the ½ mile radius that was referenced in the market study.

Dr. Crocker responded that it equates to a circle around the stations.

Mrs. Butler commented that many MARTA stations are in LCIs (Livable Centers Initiatives).

Dr. Crocker said for the remainder of 2013, staff will hold Developers' Days. MARTA is looking at March 7, 2013 for the first event.

Mr. Parker stated that he wants to make sure the Board is knowledgeable; therefore a workshop dedicated to TOD is being planned for the MARTA Board before MARTA goes out with developers.

Mrs. Butler asked Dr. Crocker to speak to staff's current initiative to look at a policy advisor.

Dr. Crocker said staff heard the Board's concerns about not having a financial advisor on board. To bridge the gap, Ms. King is working with Mrs. O'Neill and Mrs. Lancaster to develop a short term contract to have an individual help MARTA confirm sites, set up a framework that provides an analysis and review the strategic plan. This is very different from what we're looking for in the RFP process.

Mrs. Butler questioned whether it should be RFP or Intergovernmental Agreement. The intergovernmental process is about six months and it's about land use and operational issues.

Mr. Daniels asked if it will be a universal policy or a specific strategy for each parcel of land.

Mrs. Butler said it is her understanding that it will be a universal policy.

Mr. Daniels stated he recently received a lot of feedback about developers aligning with municipalities.

Dr. Crocker said he prefers to be as competitive as possible at these locations. He further noted that a framework is needed.

Dr. Edmond said it is his opinion that the policy for TOD needs to evolve as more experience is gained. What is critical is the first TODs must be done right. We're talking 3–4 layers of evaluation. If MARTA has control over Intergovernmental Agreements, it is important to create a stream of revenue, now.

Mrs. Butler said with the Letter of Understanding that was approved for Avondale, MARTA is partnering with the City of Decatur and what they want around the station.

Mr. Ashe said he wants to make sure his concerns about individual projects are not misconstrued by entities that approach MARTA about Intergovernmental Agreements. He stated that he wants to be clear that what the Board votes on is in the best interest of MARTA. He further noted that he wants to be clear about what he said, noting that he is not suggesting impropriety on governments, developers or anyone along those lines. If Intergovernmental Agreements gives MARTA successful outcomes, then that is the way to go.

Mrs. Butler said to ensure that MARTA is responsive and everyone is on board, the TOD Workshop will be helpful.

Mr. Ashe asked Mrs. Butler to explain what she meant when she said an Intergovernmental Agreement is about land use.

Mrs. Butler said when MARTA is approached by a jurisdiction, i.e., City of Decatur – Mayor Floyd was saying they are committed to economic development. The MARTA Board approved a six-month Memorandum of Agreement saying we will work with the City of Decatur (without putting out to RFP) to look at land use around that station. An example is City of Chamblee came to MARTA about TOD. MARTA said 'not dense enough' – is that land use or TOD. MARTA needs to define policy of what is a true TOD; the Authority will develop those standards moving forward. MARTA has to enter into some type of agreement with a jurisdiction to allow time to analyze. How will MARTA get revenue flow – the Authority will have its experts engaged.

Mr. Ashe said his understanding is the expert (Financial Advisor) that we are waiting on is part of the General Planning Consultant (GPC). He asked will the Financial Advisor be a member of the GPC.

Ms. Lancaster said MARTA received fifteen (15) proposals. We could get one or the other.

Ms. King said it will be whoever comes up with what is best for the Authority.

Mr. Ashe asked about the status of the procurement process.

Mrs. Lancaster said proposals were just received last week.

Mr. Parker said this should be approached as sole source procurement, making sure what's best for MARTA is documented. What's good about an Intergovernmental Agreement is it creates an opportunity for MARTA to create some value-added.

#### **Other Matters**

Mrs. McClendon announced the following special events:

- ➤ COMTO Welcome Reception honoring GM/CEO Keith T. Parker January 30<sup>th</sup> from 5:30–8:30 pm at the Georgia Freight Depot (Blue Room)
- African American Heritage Program hosted by MARTA's Department of Diversity & Equal Opportunity – February 21<sup>st</sup> at 10:00am in the MARTA Headquarters Atrium

Mrs. Southall asked about the economic impact of the proposed service modifications.

Mr. Williams said staff would take a look at it and present the information to the Board at an upcoming meeting.

# Planning & External Relations Committee 1/28/13 Page 13

# **Adjournment**

The Planning & External Relations Committee meeting adjourned at 11:08 am Respectfully submitted,

Kellee N. Mobley

Senior Executive Administrator to the Board